

Cleavages

From their Origin to their End?

Silvia Decadri—PO2650

30 November 2017

Cleavages & Party Systems

- Previous lecture: Party Systems
- Most Contemporary Parties originated from Cleavages
- Socio-Economic and Political Changes

What is a Cleavage?

- A Social Division between people in terms of some central characteristic
- The Groups involved must be conscious of their Collective Identity
- Some Organization that gives Institutional Expression to this collective identification (i.e. Trade Union, Church, Political Party)

European Cleavages: Lipset and Rokkan (1967)

- 1 Center-Periphery (Dominant vs. Subject Cultures)
- 2 Church-State
- 3 Urban-Rural
- 4 Workers-Employers (Social Class)
 - They did not anticipate the rise of Green parties or Extreme Right.

National Revolution: What happened?

- National Revolution: early 19th century
- Creation of Modern Nation-States
- Liberal Democracy
- Gives origin to two Cleavages:
 - Centre-Periphery
 - State-Church

National Revolution: Modern Nation-States

- Nation-States are:
 - Culturally Homogeneous
 - Politically Centralized

- ① Power from the Periphery to the Centre:
 - Political Power
 - Administrative System
 - Taxation System

- ② Cultural Predominance of the Centre on the Periphery:
 - Religion
 - Ethnicity
 - Languages

National Revolution: Modern Nation-States

Centre-Periphery

- Administrative Power:
 - Bureaucracy
 - Fiscal System

Consequence: Regions Lose Autonomy

- Cultural Legitimization:
 - Religion
 - Ethnicity
 - Languages

Consequence: Minorities Lose Legitimacy

- Liberal Democracy:
 - Liberal Ideology
 - Individual Civil & Voting Rights
 - Rule of Law
 - Secular Institutions
 - Free Elections
 - "State Education"

- ① Consequence: End of Aristocracy and Clergy Privilege
- ② Consequence: Catholics either with Conservatives or Outside the Political Arena

Industrial Revolution: What happened?

- Industrial Revolution: late 19th century
- Industrialization
- Urbanization
- Gives origin to two Cleavages:
 - Rural-Urban
 - Workers-Employers

Industrial Revolution: Urbanization

Rural-Urban

- 1 Agricultural vs Industrial & Trading Economic Interests
 - Agriculture becomes the Weak Sector while Industry becomes the Strong Sector
 - Trade Policies: Agrarians want Protectionism while Industrialists want Free Market

- 2 Cultural Differences between Countryside & Urban Centres
 - Different Life Style and Cultural Background reinforce divisions

Industrial Revolution: Industrialization

Workers-Employers

- This is the Most Important Cleavage
- Workers-Employers : Left-Right Dimension
- Living Conditions of Workers in Industrial Centers very Poor
- Trade Unions & Socialis Parties managed to Mobilize Working Class Discontent
- Social Rights and Welfare State vs Laissez-Faire Economy

The Post-Industrial Revolution: What happened?

- Post Second World War: 1960s & 1970s
- International Peace
- Economic Prosperity
- Domestic Security
- Gives origin to two Cleavages:
 - Materialism-Post Materialism
 - Open Societies- Closed Societies

Post-Industrial Revolution

Materialism-Post Materialism

- Younger cohort: Post-Materialist Values
 - Tolerance, Equality, Participation, Peace, Third World Solidarity
- War generation: Materialist Values
 - National Security, LawOrder, Full Employment, Tradition, Authority
- Really a New cleavage?
 1. Green parties still marginal.
 2. Simply a new variation of left politics?

Post-Industrial Revolution

Open Societies-Closed Societies

- Economic Globalization
- “Losers” & “Winners” of Globalization
- Small & Medium Enterprises, Unskilled Workers, Craftsmen, Agricultural Producers
- Anti-immigration, Cultural & Xenophobic Prejudice vs Multiethnic Societies & Cosmopolitanism

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

- Up to the 1960s, Common Assumption in Comparative Politics: Class, Religion, Regional and Ethnic Identity determine Voting Decisions.
- Cleavages: “A person thinks, politically, as he is, socially.” (Lazarsfeld et al., 1948)

- After Franklin et al. 1992 analysis, New Conventional Wisdom: Cleavages do not matter any more(?)
- Cleavages: “Almost all of the countries we have studied show a decline during our period in the ability of social cleavages to structure individual voting choice” (Franklin et al., 1992)

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

- Increased volatility of electoral results explained by a decrease in stabilizing power of social cleavages
- ① Dalton's Theory of Cognitive Mobilization.
Mass Media + Increase in Education = Citizens vote independently from social groups links
- ② Inglehart's Theory of Value Change.
New Value Related Cleavages that Cross-Cut Older Cleavages.

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

- The fact that Social Cleavages “Created” Political Parties, means that Voters’ Choices and Parties Competition are Constrained: “Freezing” HP
(Lipset and Rokkan, 1967)
- Cleavages’ structure and consequently Political Competition are determined by Group Loyalty
(Franklin at al., 1992)
- Change in Social Structure and Erosion of Group Loyalty due to Individualization bring to a decline in Electoral Relevance of Social Cleavages
- Both downplay the Programmatic Flexibility of Parties: Political Parties are really Unable to Adapt to Changing Social Structures or Group Loyalties?

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

- Lipset and Rokkan 4 Cleavages:
 - 1 Before enfranchisement of larger shares of population
 - 2 Relate to Elites: Church & Crown, Landed Gentry & Urban Business Class
 - 3 Relate to Countries with Ethnic Minorities: Spain, Belgium

- Elff's Analysis only about Religious-Secular & Class Cleavages

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

- Are Social Cleavages Dichotomous?
 - ① Manual Workers VS Self-Employed Entrepreneurs.
What about Employees of various levels?
 - ② Churchgoers VS Agnostic or Atheist.
What about Non-Regular Churchgoers?

- Necessary for Social Cleavages Irrelevant for Electoral Behaviour:
No Systematic Differences between Voters from different Social Groups and their Support for “Cleavage-Based” Parties

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

- Cross-Country Analysis: Belgium, Denmark, France, Great Britain, Italy, Netherlands, West Germany
- 1970s-2002s
- In Four of the Seven Countries Manual Workers supported Labour Parties More than Self-Employed
- In Six of the Seven Countries Churchgoers Support Christian Parties More than Non-Churchgoers
- Conclusions of a Decline in Electoral Relevance of Social Cleavages are Mixed

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

- From the Occurrence of a Change to the Process that Lead the Change
-
- 1 Does Cognitive Mobilization Undermine Cleavage-Based Alignments?
 - 2 Does Value Change Lead to the Displacement of Class Cleavages?

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

- Scenario of General Subversion of Cleavage-based alignments by Cognitive Mobilization (Dalton, 1984)
- Media + Education:
Electories increasingly Sophisticated rely Less on Social Cues
- Highly Educated Individuals with Access to Information do not need to be Guided by Social Cues when they Vote

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Eiff (2007)

- Scenario of Cognitive Demobilization
- More TV Less Social Capital (Putnam, 1995)
TV Entertainment

- Scenario of Varying Role of Cognitive Mobilization
- Media + Education:
 - 1 Electorates increasingly Sophisticated rely Less/More/The Same on Social Cues
 - 2 The effects of cognitive mobilization on the patterns of electoral behavior are not unconditional

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

- Scenario of Direct Displacement of Class Cleavages by Value-Based Cleavages (Inglehart, 1977).
- Different Priority of Economic Concerns Materialist vs Post-Materialist:
 - 1 Weaker difference in Economic Interests among Post-Materialists
 - 2 More Post-Materialist in the Population:
Electoralates rely Less on Social-Class Differences

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

- “Greening of the Left Scenario”
Left Parties take up Post Materialist Agenda and Votes of the Middle Class
Right Parties take up Materialist Agenda and Votes of the Working Class
- “Split Within The Middle-Classes Scenario”
Left Parties take up Post-Materialist Agenda and Votes of a Share of Middle Class: New Left Faction vs Old Right Faction
- “Electoral Irrelevance of Value Change Scenario”
Established Parties Ignore the Post-Materialist agenda,

Cleavages: The End of An Era?

Elff (2007)

Results:

- Finds no evidence for a relationship between watching TV or having a higher level of education on class voting.
- Finds little support for the hypothesis that post-materialist values are undermining class cleavages.
- It appears traditional cleavages still play a role in party systems and voter behavior.